DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 441 124 CE 080 135

TITLE Career Development. Symposium 34. [Concurrent Symposium Session at AHRD Annual Conference, 2000.]
PUB DATE 2000-03-08
NOTE 23p.; In: Academy of Human Resource Development Conference Proceedings (Raleigh-Durham, North Carolina, March 8-12, 2000); see CE 080 095.
PUB TYPE Collected Works - General (020) -- Speeches/Meeting Papers (150)
EDRS PRICE MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *Acculturation; Adult Development; Adult Education; *Career Change; Career Development; Career Education; Career Planning; *Cross Cultural Training; Diversity (Institutional); Higher Education; Hispanic Americans; Human Resources; *Labor Force Development; Management Development; *Midlife Transitions; Models; Needs Assessment; Promotion (Occupational)
IDENTIFIERS Ohio

ABSTRACT

Three presentations are provided from Symposium 34, Career Development, of the Academy of Human Resource Development (HRD) 2000 Conference Proceedings. "Emerging Career Development Needs as Reported by Adult Students at Four Ohio Institutions of Higher Education: A Qualitative Study" (Kathryn S. Hoff) reports 4 major themes emerged from interviews with 10 adult students: need for self-awareness, occupational knowledge requirements, need for decision-making strategies, and challenges to career implementation. It presents a Web of Personal Career Reality developed as a descriptive model of the adult career development process. "Mid-Life Mid-Career Renewal--An Outcome of Involuntary Career Transition as Experienced by Federal Employees" (Sara Ervin Walser, Neal Chalofsky) reviews a study that confirms existence of a mid-career renewal stage, triggered by an involuntary career transition and affected by factors related to the inner self, personal and work environment, and transition process. "The Role of Acculturation in Career Advancement among Hispanic Corporate Managers" (Lizette Zuniga, Cindy Skaruppa, Toni Powell) compares Mendoza's (1989) theory of acculturation to the propositions derived from the investigation into the role of acculturation. It reveals that Hispanic corporate managers viewed acculturation and career advancement as directly related to each other and substantiates Mendoza's theory. The papers contain reference sections. (YLB)

Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made
from the original document.

ED 441 124

2000 AHRD Conference

Career Development

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)
☑ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.
☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.
• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

Symposium 34

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY
Hoff/Walser/Powell
TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

1

Raleigh-Durham, NC

March 8 - 12, 2000

CE 060 135

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Emerging Career Development Needs as Reported by Adult Students at Four Ohio Institutions of Higher Education: A Qualitative Study

Kathryn S. Hoff
Bowling Green State University

The purpose of this study was to assess the career development needs of adult students at four Ohio higher education institutions. The qualitative research design employed in interviewing ten adult students allowed an emergence of four major themes: the need for self-awareness, occupational knowledge requirements, the need for decision-making strategies, and the challenges to career implementation. A Web of Personal Career Reality was developed as a descriptive model of the adult career development process.

Keywords: Career Development, Adult Development, Career Planning Model

Career development for adults is becoming a complex sociological need, requiring a high level of professional expertise. The estimated number of careers that Americans entering the job market today will have within their lifetime ranges from three to twelve (Hall & Mirvis, 1995a, 1995b; Herr & Cramer, 1996; McDaniels, 1989). As the population of the United States ages, life expectancy is lengthening, and people are expecting to have not one, but multiple careers within their lifetime (Herr & Cramer, 1996). Adults in the workforce are attending colleges and universities to update their knowledge and skills in record numbers. Many returning to higher education or making any career change, are seeking assistance from career professionals.

The purpose of this study was to assess the career development needs of adult students from their perspective. The qualitative methods used in this study allowed the participants to articulate the career development needs they had identified, and allowed the researcher to probe for clarification and additional information.

The initial questions asked included the following: What career issues do adults who are pursuing further education face? Are these challenges minor adjustments or major directional changes in the career path chosen earlier in life? What questions confront these adults in making a career transition? What goals are these adult students working toward? What kind of information do these adults think they need to make informed career and life decisions?

Career development professionals recognize the increasing number of adult students requesting assistance. If these professionals are to meet the needs, they must first answer the question, "What career services do adult students need"? This study, based on data gathered through individual interviews with adult students enrolled at four colleges in Ohio, provided an answer for the participants involved. By describing their experiences these adults conveyed their uniqueness, and therefore the requirement for individual counseling and assistance in meeting their career development needs.

The definition of adult student used for this study acknowledges the multiple roles and responsibilities of adults (Keierleber & Hansen, 1992). The definition used "includes students who have stopped out of college, who attend college part-time, who hold full-time or part-time jobs, who have established their own homes, and who have assumed primary life roles other than that of student" (Polson, 1989; in Keierleber & Hansen, 1992, pp. 312-313).

Emerging Perspective on Career Change

Whereas a career, defined by Arthur, Hall, and Lawrence (1989) as "the evolving sequence of a person's work experiences over time" (p. 8), could formerly span a working lifetime, it is predicted today that the average person may have three or four careers in the span of his or her work life (Hall & Mirvis, 1995a, 1995b). There is ample evidence that the level of education needed for an individual to continue being productive in the American workforce is changing. According to the 1999 *Almanac Issue of the Chronicle of Higher Education*, 42.6% of all students attending institutions of higher education in the fall of 1995 were over the age of 25.

In addition to higher educational requirements, there is also evidence that the number of developmental stages of adulthood, as have been described for the last two decades, are also increasing and changing. Results of

Copyright © 2000, Kathryn S. Hoff

research conducted over a seven-year period on the life stages of adults were reported in a popular press book, entitled *New Passages* (Sheehy, 1995). Sheehy believed there are more stages adults traverse than those Levinson, Darrow, Klein, Levinson, and McKee (1978) proposed in their study of the stages of adult male development. The societal expectation during the time of Levinson's study was that career and life choices made during adolescence and early adulthood would lead to a fulfilling existence over a span of several decades (Levinson et al., 1978). Reality is that today's society has changed and not everyone proceeds through the stages at either the same pace, or in many cases, the same order. As individuals are trying to build satisfying lives, making career choices has become an activity engaged in throughout the life span.

Broader Context of Career Change

Many researchers have studied the causes of midlife career change, especially the motivation prompting the change. External factors, such as technological, economic, and social changes are causing career transitions. Internal issues, both interpersonal and intrapersonal, cause many adults to seek new career challenges – the desire to expand marketable skills, enhance self-fulfillment, and seek new purpose in life (Boyett & Conn, 1991; Chiappone, 1992; Glassner, 1994; Merriam & Clark, 1991). Rapid technological advancement, shifting demographics, rising educational levels of the American populace, increasing numbers of dual-career couples or families, changes in working conditions and cultures within our organizations, and an increasingly global economy are among these factors (Boyett & Conn, 1991; Brown & Minor, 1989; Chiappone, 1992; Drummond & Ryan, 1995; Glassner, 1994; Gutteridge, Leibowitz, & Shore, 1993; Herr & Cramer, 1996; Horton & Engels, 1992; Keierleber & Hansen, 1992; Montana & Higginson, 1978; Vondracek, Lerner, & Schulenberg, 1986).

Expanded Concept of Career Success

The concepts of career development and success have changed as a result of the factors stated above. The literature is replete with definitions of career development, especially as it relates to adults. The literature of the past decade emphasizes change and content as common themes. Another common theme is that the goals set and decisions made regarding career and life issues must be made in the context of the person's individual situation (Abrego & Brammer, 1992; Lea & Leibowitz, 1992; Levinson et al., 1978; Vondracek et al., 1986). These decisions and goals must be constantly reevaluated since the context within which one performs her or his profession is in constant flux.

Required Set of Expanded Skills

As we approach the twenty-first century, it is apparent that acquisition of a new array of technical and professionals skills will be required on a continuing basis (Herr, 1990; Mirvis & Hall, 1996). There is also an additional set of skills required, that of managing one's own career.

We are becoming a society of lifelong learners, not only to remain competitive in today's marketplace, but also to increase our feeling of fulfillment in life. There are many ways in which adults are increasing their job skills and their overall knowledge. Many employees are taking advantage of on-the-job training and educational reimbursement programs offered by their organizations, which pay registration fees, books and materials, and sometimes travel expenses. Many of these adults are pursuing additional education to achieve a more complex set of goals. These include more productive and effective involvement in community problem solving, striving for personal satisfaction, sharing expertise, and meeting new people (Lewis, 1988; Schlossberg, Lynch, & Chickering, 1991).

Implications for Career Services Professionals

As the need for career change is recognized, many adults are finding themselves in transition, rethinking their skills, interests, aptitudes, and life goals. Of those seeking further education, many will require assistance in making choices about their educational experience and related issues.

These adult learners will seek assistance from career services professionals on campus, at their present employer, or through private services. As career development professionals respond to the increase in adults making

career changes, it is important that these professionals come to appreciate the services that are required by this population. Because the issues are unique to each adult at each stage of his or her educational pursuit or career change, the questions posed and the goals sought were ascertained through qualitative research.

Included in the literature review conducted prior to commencement of this research study, were the theories of adult career development, career development, adult development, adult learning, as well as the characteristics of adult students and possible interventions.

Methodology

As stated earlier, the purpose of this study was to ascertain from adult students on the campuses of four Ohio colleges and universities their perception of their career development needs. The research methods chosen for this study are qualitative and were based on a naturalistic, constructivist paradigm (Guba & Lincoln, 1989; Lincoln & Guba, 1985). Creswell (1994) defined the qualitative paradigm as "an inquiry process of understanding a social or human problem, based on building a complex, holistic picture, formed with words, reporting detailed views of informants, and conducted in a natural setting"(pp. 1-2).

Research Design

True to naturalistic inquiry, the design of this study continued to evolve as the study progressed. Major steps in the process were identified, however, prior to the beginning of the study. Using techniques of purposive sampling, ten participants were selected and interviewed, interview transcripts and other documents were analyzed, the trustworthiness of the data was addressed, and the case report was written. The researcher, true to the naturalistic paradigm, continued to alter the design and questions as indicated by the ongoing data collection and analysis process.

One Ohio institution of higher education was chosen from each of the following Carnegie (1994) Classifications: research, doctoral, comprehensive, and associate degree granting institutions. The sites were chosen based on the willingness of gatekeepers to participate. The four participating institutions will remain anonymous, remaining true to the design of a naturalistic inquiry. The gatekeepers for this study were the Directors of Career Services on each campus.

Two sampling techniques were utilized for the selection of participants. The first was criterion-based. The researcher wanted to include in the study a diverse group of adults from four different types of institutions within the state of Ohio, men and women, Caucasians and African-Americans, full- and part-time students, individuals employed full- and part-time while attending school, and students who were at different stages in both their educational pursuits and career decision-making processes. The second sampling strategy utilized was the network or snowball technique. At the conclusion of each interview, the participant was asked to suggest the names of adult students who may have had different experiences than their own in their quest for career development assistance, or who had needs for which they had not sought assistance.

The ten participants represented the crite rion variables (i.e., gender, ethnic heritage, class rank, part- or full-time [both student and employee], and career and life issues) that were established prior to participant selection. Among the participants, there were seven women and three men; two of the women were African-American and the other eight participants were Caucasian. Two participants had completed associate degrees and were beginning the process of identifying appropriate baccalaureate degree programs, three others were also undergraduate students at the time of our interviews, four had completed baccalaureate degrees, and one had just completed the requirements for a Master of Arts degree.

Three of the participants held full-time jobs while studying, with seven of the participants holdi ng one or more part-time jobs. Six participants stated that they had been active as volunteers during their courses of study.

Some of the participants fluctuated between attending classes part- and full-time, partly as a result of their financial resources. Four participants had been both full- and part-time students, the other six had attended only full-time.

"The instrument of choice in naturalistic inquiry is the human" (Lincoln & Guba, 1985, p. 236). The collection of data and subsequent analysis is conducted solely by a human researcher, who brings to the process a set of values and a lens through which reality is seen. These values and lenses are a part of the researcher that is always present. As the data were collected and analyzed by reviewing written documents (questionnaires and resumes), engaging participants in conversation (semi-structured interviews), observing behaviors, and categorizing

information, the values and lenses of the researcher remained a vital component of the process. The human instrument was continually analyzing data as it was collected, both on-and off-site, as well as during the more formal process of analysis conducted following interviews and observations.

Four primary sources of data were utilized in this study: demographic questionnaires, resumes of potential participants, semi-structured interviews, and observations. Information provided in the questionnaires and resumes provided background data and served as conversation starters for the interviews. The intent of the interviews was to obtain information from each participant regarding his or her career decisions, to articulate the present status of career decisions, and to determine the needs each perceived in making career decisions. The following are sample questions used in the initital interviews:

- I'd like to begin by asking you to tell me about major life and career decisions you hav made. Include in your description the significant events and people who have influenced these decisions.
- It is important for me to understand your thinking about your career. How do you define "career"? Please tell me what "career" means to you.
- As you think about the decisions you've made thus far, can you identify any factors that facilitated your career choices?
- What hurdles can you identify that you have encountered in your decision making process?
- What prompted you to pursue additional education at this point in your career? What do ;you hope to accomplish as a result?
- What do others who are important to you think about what you are doing now (i.e., attending classes, contemplating career change)?
- I'd like you to reflect on and describe how and where you think your career fits into your total life picture.
- What kinds of information do you believe you need to make logical, rational, informed career and life decisions?

Observations made during the interview process were recorded via hand-written notes taken during and immediately following the interviews. Analysis of the data was a process of identifying categories and themes and making sense of them as constructions of the participants. The constant comparative method was used in the analysis of all data gathered during the course of this study.

The constructions evolving from the realities of the participants in this study, as obtaine d through document analysis, interviews, and observations, member checking, log keeping, and peer debriefing, were reported using the case report method. Because the purpose of this study was to describe the perceptions of adult students regarding their career development needs, the major emphasis of the case report is descriptive. The data gathered were analyzed and interpreted so that the researcher's construction, and the multiple realities of the participants, may be shared with the readers.

Results and Findings

Career development specialists have made assumptions about the needs of adult students. Many have asserted that the needs of adults are unique and the traditional methods of career guidance may not be appropriate. Assumptions are made that adults, by virtue of age and working experience, know about their own interests, abilities, aptitudes, values, etc.; requirements of various work environments; how to make logical decisions; and how to implement those decisions, once made. While each of the participants in this study possessed life and work experiences, each demonstrated unique needs as he or she confronted academic, career, and life decisions. Some displayed a need for assistance in learning about and integrating knowledge of self with the world of work. Others had obtained and internalized this information, but required assistance in decision-making. Still others had made a career decision, but were unsure of appropriate implementation strategies.

Although some of the adults in this study could articulate the needs for assistance stated above, most were ignorant of the resources available to them on their college campuses. One of the only areas that participants could articulate needing assistance in was job hunting and career implementation.

Others did not realize that they even had needs that could be met with the assistance of Career Services practitioners. They were not aware of their own needs for self-assessment, exploration of occupational information, or obtaining decision-making skills.

Individual career and life profiles were written for each of the ten participants in this study. General information was included regarding their personal career definitions, goals, reasons for making a career transition,

life roles, obstacles encountered, motivation to continue working toward their goals, and support received from significant others.

Four themes evolved during the process of analysis and were categorized using the following broad labels: the need for self-awareness, occupational knowledge requirements, need for decision-making strategies, and challenges to career implementation. Within each broad theme are sub themes

The findings of this study are discussed in relation to the major themes identified during analysis of the data. Although these themes could have been predicted, the interrelatedness of these themes as described by participants in this study, demonstrated a complexity not implied in the literature. Therefore, a *Web of Personal Career Reality* © 1997 was created to portray more accurately this complexity. The career choice factors (e.g., multiple roles, past work experience, lack of self-efficacy, limited occupational knowledge, and poor decision-making skills) included in the themes are frequently not presented to career practitioners by adult students in a prescribed, linear sequence. As a result, assisting these students with career and life decision-making is extraordinarily complicated. The *Web* can provide the framework for assisting adult career changers with the diverse factors required during their decision-making processes.

At the center of the *Web* is the individual's perception of his or her career and life vision. Surrounding this core are the four major themes, with related sub themes, which emerged during the analysis of the data. Also included around the core are factors that can have a direct influence at each stage of the decision-making or career implementation process. The many two-directional arrows signify the interconnectedness of all of the variables. Although adults may request assistance with finding a job (career implementation), thinking they are at step four of a four step process, use of the *Web* can promote an understanding that more self-exploration and investigation of occupational requirements and environments may be needed.

True to naturalistic inquiry, these findings are not intended to be generalizable beyond the participants of this study. Therefore, the readers are encouraged to compare the situations of the adult career changers with whom they are working to the participants in this study. This comparison will help to determine the transferability of the implications and suggestions to their own settings.

Findings: Need for Self-Awareness

In the broad theme of self-awareness, it was found that the participants varied significantly in their levels of self-understanding, self-concept, self-efficacy, and in their personal definitions of career. They also differed in the number and types of roles and responsibilities assumed. Individuals with a higher degree of self-awareness were more directed and clear in their choices of academic major and career field. Several of the participants could not articulate their own career development needs, especially those whose self-efficacy in their chosen academic major or career field was low. For some, the issue of career choice that would have a direct impact on broader life issues, and their discomfort with the possible outcomes was intrusive, permeating every facet of their lives.

The personal definitions of career varied based on the unique developmental history of each individual. For some, the definition of career, formulated during the adolescent years, had remained unchanged. For others, the concept had continued to develop throughout their working lives, reflecting their desire for personal growth and career change. Some of the participants never thought of themselves as having a career, they were engaged in jobs to survive. Others entered an occupation, which had been chosen for them by parents, teachers, or high school guidance counselors, without much thought or reflection by the participant.

The adults in this study made career decisions based on limited self-knowledge, usually using only the understanding of their interests. A few had considered their own values and those of family members, as well as how those values had changed over the years, as the participants had made decisions to change careers. Very few of them had consciously considered their aptitudes and skills, or those required in their chosen career fields.

There was evidence provided by each participant that the entanglement of career and life issues caused consternation during the exploration and decision-making processes. As participants recognized dissatisfaction in their work lives, and reassessed personal and societal values, many sought new career challenges to enhance self-fulfillment and to satisfy their desire for new purposes in life. Every participant expressed some level of dissatisfaction with his or her position, and a desire to enter a career field in which a difference could be made in the lives of others.

The participants in this study described their involvement in a variety of roles and responsibilities in addition to that of adult student and career changer. They also displayed a diversity of developmental stages in which they were engaged, and an array of levels of achievement. As could be expected, there were also a number of personality types, needs, values, and interests demonstrated during the course of our interactions.

Findings: Occupational Knowledge Requirements

The participants in this study demonstrated a very low level of occupational awareness. Most were basing their decisions on limited occupational knowledge and occupational stereotypes. There was very little evidence that participants had used standardized career information resources describing career fields of potential interest. Only a few of the participants had spoken with professionals in their targeted occupations.

The few who stated that they had some understanding of their career field, however, still could not demonstrate their understanding of the day-to-day activities, skills required, specialized knowledge needed, or working conditions to be expected. A compounding factor to this lack of information was their unfamiliarity with campus or community resources where they could obtain realistic occupational information.

Findings: Need for Decision-Making Strategies

Many adults today are unaware of both their own potential occupational preferences, and the skills required to make career decisions. This is a direct result of earlier perspectives on vocational guidance that assumed that once a career decision was made in adolescence, there would be no need for further action in this area. For most of the participants in this study, early career decisions had been so strongly influenced by others that these individuals were not conscious of having made those decisions. A few stated that others had made the decisions for them. The consequences of having had others make these decisions included career dissatisfaction, lowered self-esteem, and a sense of not fitting the work environment.

Although the participants in this study all reported having returned to higher education to make career changes, few could articulate the process they had used to make their choices of either academic major or career field. A very narrow exploration of options followed the recognition and acknowledgement of dissatisfaction with their career situations. In most cases, participants had become aware of one option they thought viable, and without further exploration, initiated the steps to prepare for that career.

It was also evident that not all of the participants had considered the outcomes possible as a result of their efforts in obtaining additional education. Some, however, stated clearly what they expected to occur as a result of their efforts.

Findings: Challenges to Career Implementation

Although the participants in this study had not found a need for continuing education in their previous occupations (with one exception), many anticipated that in the future additional education would be incorporated into their lifestyle. There was limited evidence, however, that the participants in this study had the skills to engage in a planned process to change or manage their own careers. When asked specifically about their career development needs, the participants cited only their needs for assistance in the job search process, even though some were still in the exploratory stages.

One theme that was consistent with all participants was their lack of knowledge of the breadth and depth of academic and career advising services available to them on their college campuses. A few of the participants stated that they did not know there was a Career Services Office on their campus; others had heard of the office but had the impression that the services were limited to assisting students with resume writing, interviewing skills, and job search activities.

Implications for Practitioners and Significance to the Field of HRD

As adults attend colleges and universities in increasing numbers, it is important that career practitioners, in addition to a thorough understanding of career theory and counseling techniques, learn about adult development theory and integrate its principles into their practice. It is also imperative that career practitioners understand the characteristics of this population of adult students and their needs (Gianakos, 1996; Goldstein, 1984; Keierleber & Hansen, 1992; OConnor, 1994; and Whitt, 1994).

Due to the qualitative methodology used in this study, there were a number of questions that emerged, which, if studied further could provide valuable information for career development professionals. The information gathered from these ten participants provides a basis from which larger, more comprehensive studies will be conducted.

The intent of this study was twofold: to explore and discover the career development needs of adults students and to help career development professionals gain insight into and understanding of the unique needs of the individuals in this growing population. Using qualitative methods, ten adult students were interviewed to obtain their perceptions of their own career development needs. Also discussed were ways in which these needs had been or could be met by the available career development professionals on their respective campuses.

These ten individuals freely disclosed information regarding their struggles to address their complex car eer and life issues. It is hoped that the information obtained through this disclosure will assist Career Services professionals in understanding and appreciating the uniqueness of each adult student. This insight into the lives of these ten students can be useful to Career Services professionals in their efforts to design programs and services which are responsive to all student needs. It can also be useful to researchers as we continue to explore the needs of adult career changers on a larger scale through further research.

References

Abrego, P., & Brammer, L. (1992). Counseling adults in midlife career transitions. In H. D. Lea & Z. B. Leibowitz (Eds.), *Adult career development: Concepts, issues, and practice* (2nd ed., pp. 234-254). Alexandria, VA: The National Career Development Association.

Arthur, M. B., Hall, D. T., & Lawrence, B. S. (Eds.). (1989). *Handbook of career theory*. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Boyett, J. H., & Conn, H. P. (1991). *Workplace 2000: The revolution reshaping American business*. New York: Dutton.

Brown, D., & Minor, C. W. (1989). *Working in America: A status report on planning and problems*. Alexandria, VA: The National Career Development Association.

Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching. (1994). *A classification of institutions of higher education: 1994 edition*. Princeton, NJ: The Carnegie Foundation.

Chiappone, J. M. (1992). The career development professional of the 199s: A training model. In H. D. Lea & Z. B. Leibowitz (Eds.), *Adult career development: Concepts, issues, and practice* (2nd ed., pp. 364-379). Alexandria, VA: The National Career Development Association.

The Chronicle of Higher Education, (1999). College enrollment by age of students, fall 1995. *Almanac Issue*, p. 17.

Creswell, J. W. (1994). *Research design: Qualitative and quantitative approaches*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

Drummond, R. J., & Ryan, C. W. (1995). *Career counseling: A developmental approach*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Merrill.

Gianakos, I. (1996). Career development differences between adult and traditional-aged learners. *Journal of Career Development, 22(3),* 211-223.

Goldstein, H. (1984). Changing structure of work: Occupational trends and impolications. In N. C. Gysbers (Ed.)., *Designing careers* (pp. 54-77). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Glassner, B. (1994). *Career crash: Americaś new crisis* . New York: Simon & Schuster.

Guba, E. G., & Lincoln, Y. S. (1989). *Fourth generation evaluation*. Newbury Park: Sage.

Gutteridge, T. G., Leibowitz, Z. B , & Shore, J. E. (1993). *Organizational career development: Benchmarks for building a world-class workforce.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Hall, D. T., & Mirvis, P. H. (1995a,). Careers as lifelong learning. In A. Howard (Ed.), *The changing nature of work* (pp. 323-362). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Hall, D. T., & Mirvis, P. H. (1995b). The new career contract: Developing the whole person at midlife and beyond. *Journal of Vocational Behavior, 47,* 269-289.

Herr, E. L. (1990). Employment counseling in a global economy. *Journal of Employment Counseling, 27,* 147-159.

Herr, E. L., & Cramer, S. H. (1996). *Career guidance and counseling through the life span: Systematic approaches* (5th ed.). New York: Harper Collins.

Horton, G. M., & Engels, D. W. (1992). Career counseling for the mature worker. In H. D. Lea & Z. B. Leibowitz (Eds.), *Adult career development: Concepts, issues, and practice* (2nd ed., pp. 255-268). Alexandria, VA: The National Career Development Association.

Keierleber, D. L., & Hansen, L. S. (1992). A coming of age: Addressing the career development needs of adult students in university settings. In H. D. Lea & Z. B. Leibowitz (Eds.), *Adult career development: Concepts, issues, and practice* (2nd ed., pp. 312-339). Alexandria, VA: The National Career Development Association.

Lea, H. D., & Leibowitz, Z. B. (Eds.). (1992). *Adult career development: Concepts, issues, and practices* (2nd ed.). Alexandria, VA: The National Career Development Association.

Levinson, D. J., Darrow, C. N., Klein, E. B., Levinson, M. H., & McKee, B. (1978). *The seasons of a mans life* . New York: Ballantine.

Lewis, L. H. (1988). Ingredients of successful programming. In L. H. Lewis (Ed.), *New directions for continuing education: No. 39. Addressing the needs of returning women* (pp. 5-17). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry*. Newbury Park: Sage.

McDaniels, C. (1989). *The changing workplace: Career counseling strategies for the 1990s and beyond* . San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Merriam, S. B., & Clark, M. C. (1991). *Lifelines: Patterns of work, love, and learning in adulthood*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Mirvis, P. H., & Hall, D. T. (1996). New organizational forms and the new career. In D. T. Hall (Ed.), *The career is dead –long live the career: A relational approach to careers* (pp. 72-104). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Montana, P. J., & Higginson, M. V. (1978). *Career life planning for Americans: Agenda for organizations and individuals*. New York: National Center for Career Life Planning: A Division of American Management Association.

O'Connor, P. J. (1994). The needs of adult university students: A case study. *College and University, 69, 2*, 84-86.

Polson, C. J. (1989). Adult learners: Characteristics, concerns, and challenges to higher education – a bibliography. *NACADA Journal, 9(2)*, 86-112.

Schlossberg, N. K., Lynch, A. Q., & Chickering, A. W. (1991). *Improving higher education environments*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Sheehy, G. (1995). *New passages: Mapping your life across time*. New York: Random House.

Vondracek, F. W., Lerner, R. M., & Schulenberg, J. E. (1986). *Career development: A lifespan developmental approach*. Hillsdale, NJ: Erlbaum.

Whitt, E. J. (1994). Encouraging adult learner involvement. *NASPA Journal, 31*, 4, 309-318.

Mid-Life Mid-Career Renewal - An Outcome of Involuntary Career Transition as Experienced by Federal Employees

Sara Ervin Walser
Vantage Human Resource Services, Inc.

Neal Chalofsky
The George Washington University

Organizational and career stability are challenged by the complexities of the modern workplace. Mid-career federal workers who had lost their positions through downsizing were the subjects of this qualitative study. Data was generated through in-depth interviews and theme analysis. The study confirms the existence of a mid-career renewal stage, triggered by an involuntary career transition, and affected by factors related to the inner self, the personal and work environment, and the transition process.

Keywords: Career Renewal, Mid-Life, Downsizing

This phenomenological study dealt with mid-life, mid-career federal workers who, when faced with an involuntary career/job transition, went on to turn the experience into a vehicle for successful career renewal and growth. For the purposes of this study, career renewal was defined as the generation of a new career self-concept (Super, Savikas & Super, 1996; Super, 1957, 1980, 1990) through reconsideration of motives, inner values, abilities, and interests as they coalesce into themes for the individual's life (Abrego & Brammer, 1992; Murphy & Burck, 1976.) Results of the research provide an understanding of the phenomenon of career renewal, identify factors which facilitate or inhibit the career renewal process, and provide suggested guidelines for use by human resource professionals and career counselors charged with facilitating the transition process (Greller & Stroh, 1995; Hall & Mirvis, 1995.)

Problem Statement

There are few studies exploring the meaning of mid-life, mid-career renewal as experienced by workers who have been affected by involuntary separation (Abrego & Brammer, 1992; Greller & Stroh, 1995; Latack & Dozier, 1986.) There are fewer still which attempt to determine the nature of this experience for federal employees who joined the workforce expecting a stable work environment and a progressive linear career path (Atwood, Coke, Cooper, & Loria, 1995; Latack & Dozier, 1986.) This body of workers has operated for over a century in a work setting governed by generally protective guidelines and regulations. Provisions of employment were well known, well publicized, and often perceived as a pivotal reason for choosing federal employment (Whitehead, 1996.)

In recent years, however, efforts to downsize the federal government became prevalent and substantive, culminating in the establishment in 1993 of the National Performance Review (NPR) with the goals of organizational restructuring, creating a less expensive and more efficient federal government, and alteration of the culture of the national federal bureaucracy (National Performance Review, 1993, 1997.) For the first time in recent history, massive federal downsizing and Reductions-in-Force were initiated. Mid-level positions, in particular management and supervisory positions, were specifically targeted for abolishment.

Despite the large numbers of individuals affected, and the significant implications of these actions, there is no clear understanding of what the involuntary separation means to those federal employees who experience it, the impact on individuals forced out of their jobs. Nor is there a sense of how some of the affected individuals turn this event into an opportunity for career renewal, while others do not. What differentiates the successful response from the less successful? How are successful career renewal journeys accomplished?

The current employment market environment and relative lack of intensive research into the topic of involuntary mid-life career transitions (Greller & Stroh, 1995; Latack & Dozier, 1986) highlight the need for a more complete understanding of the phenomenon. Along with the potentially negative and traumatic effects, forced career transition also brings the potential for career renewal and personal growth, including the reappraisal of previous vocational choices,

Copyright retained by the authors

reformulation of the role of work in the life plan, renewal of career commitments and development of new career strategies (Bejian & Salomone, 1995; Eby & Buch, 1995; Murphy & Burck, 1976.) How individuals respond and react to these challenges will impact their ability to move successfully into other stages of their careers and their lives. This study is designed to provide suggested answers to the problem.

Theoretical Framework

The bases for this study are the theoretical principles of career development, studies of individuals at mid-life, transition theories and reviews of organizational downsizings. This research has theoretical significance because of the current focus on redefining careers (Rifkin, 1995; Bridges, 1994), and the nature of the employment contract which has changed so dramatically over the last ten years (Drucker, 1995; NPR, 1993, Rifkin, 1995.)

Much of the existing career theory deals with initial career choice which is presumed to be followed by upward progression in a stable organizational setting. Scant attention is paid to mid-life career issues (Abrego & Brammer, 1992; Greller & Stroh, 1995.) Until very recently, a common assumption existed that, by mid-life, individuals were settled in their careers, meeting their generativity needs by mentoring younger workers, and no longer feeling the impetus to explore new career possibilities of their own (Erikson, 1963; Gutteridge Leibowitz & Shore, 1993; Levinson, 1986; Levinson Darrow, Klein, Levinson, & McKee, 1978.)

Donald Super, one of the best known developmental career theorists, described the stages of a career in a sequential mode: exploration, entry, establishment, maintenance and disengagement (Super, 1957, 1980.) Subsequent career related research indicated that the middle years of a worker's life involved much more than maintenance. Murphy and Burck (1976) proposed that an additional stage - renewal - be placed between establishment and maintenance. Subsequent revisions were made to Super's model (Super, 1990; Super, Savikas & Super, 1996) but, as is true in much of the career literature (Greller & Stroh, 1995), little attention is given to involuntary disruption of the career path.

Downsizings (Balutis, 1996; Cameron, 1994; Lacey, 1988; Rifkin, 1995) often cut short the mid-life processes described in these existing career models, and force the affected individual to develop transition strategies (Latack, 1990; Latack & Dozier, 1986; Sargent & Schlossberg, 1988; Schlossberg, Waters, & Goodman, 1995) if they are to have a successful experience. While transition theories are helpful, however, their focus is primarily on re-employment, not necessarily fulfillment and renewal.

Today's career patterns must be viewed in a different light. The focus must be on growth, rather than decline, as a outcome of unforeseen change. The issues under review are central to a wide body of knowledge regarding involuntary mid-career transition and successful career renewal. This study addresses the means through which a successful career renewal was achieved. Empirical applications exist, in that lessons learned from this study of federal employees may be applied to other settings and to the issue of the changes in the implicit psychological employment contract.

Research Questions

1. How is involuntary career transition related to the establishment of a renewed career self-concept during mid-life?
2. How has the mid-life career renewal become a part of the larger process of adult development for the individual?
3. How was the successful completion of the career renewal process related to the level of support received from others during the process itself?
4. How did situational factors such as prior experience, financial resources, the manner in which the downsizing was handled by the employer, and other concurrent stresses impact on the meaning of the career renewal experience for the individual?
5. How did personal and demographic factors such as length of tenure, and state of health; and psychological factors such as commitment, values and a sense of control over the process contribute to the career renewal?
6. What strategies (job search, self-assessment, additional training/education, coping mechanisms) were employed by those who experienced a successful career renewal?

Methodology

The phenomenological method was employed in this study. Individuals who had been affected by involuntary job loss served as both co-researchers, contributing to the generation of ideas, providing insight and drawing conclusions; and as co-subjects actively participating in the activity being studied (Reason, 1994.) Through the vehicle of an in-depth interview, these individuals described their career renewal experiences in the context in which they occurred.

Each co-researcher had a minimum of seven years consecutive federal experience and was between 40 and 55 years of age. The primary researcher contacted federal outplacement centers in Maryland, Virginia, and the District of Columbia; described the nature of the study; and requested referral to individuals meeting the study parameters. Career counselors who had assisted in career transition efforts in federal agencies were also contacted. In addition, co-researchers often suggested other possible participants. An introductory letter describing the study and requesting an expression of interest was sent to prospective participants. Preliminary interviews were conducted with fifteen individuals; ten participated fully in the research. Prior to beginning the study, the primary researcher also conducted pilot interviews with two individuals meeting the study parameters. Results of the pilot interviews were used to refine the research method.

Using the research questions as a framework, the primary researcher conducted in-depth interviews, averaging one and one-half hours in length. A verbatim transcript was produced. Co-researchers' individual career renewal stories were elicited, while not omitting consideration of certain factors directly related to the study, specifically the federal employment milieu (Moustakas, 1990; Rubin & Rubin, 1995.) Both the researcher and the co-researchers guaranteed confidentiality of the interview, each of whom signed a statement describing their understanding of the purpose and parameters of the study.

From the verbatim transcripts, the primary researcher developed narrative Profiles in the co-researchers' own words (Seidman, 1998.) She then grouped passages from the individual profiles into categories and looked for emerging thematic connections (Boyatzis, 1998; Kvale, 1996.) The individual profiles and suggested themes were reviewed by the appropriate co-researcher and modified if necessary to be certain that the essence of the experience had been captured. A sample of the profiles was also reviewed by a third party researcher to confirm the trustworthiness of the grouping of themes and the meanings constructed. General themes related to the research questions were formulated using the individual themes as a base. Bracketing was employed to facilitate suspension of the primary researcher's own conscious biases (Douglas & Moustakas, 1984.)

Limitations

While the study itself is limited to federal employees, this population is comprised of individuals who entered the workforce with explicit expectations regarding the provisions of their employment, including tenure requirements and ensuing benefits, and thus represents others of their generation. The study population is, therefore, representative of mid-career employees who must come to terms with an employment market which differs in many important respects from that which existed when employment began.

Results and Findings

Seven major themes emerged from the interviews. The majority of the co-researchers mentioned these themes as having a significant relationship to the career renewal process. They are grouped here in accordance with the issues raised by the research questions.

Establishment of a Renewed Career Self-concept during Mid-life

(1) The Reduction-in-Force (RIF) served as a trigger in the development of a renewed career self-concept, and the re-examination of the role of work in the life plan. In most cases, this process had already begun prior to the RIF. The loss of a job gave this re-examination more urgency.

(2) During the renewal process, the role of federal employment in the career self-concept was re-evaluated. Federal service had been a large component of the co-researchers' career self-concept. This component is either no longer present, or the expectations of mutual loyalty which underpinned that part of the identity no longer exist. A successful career renewal experience requires acceptance of the realities of the newer work environment.

Mid-life Career Renewal as Part of the Larger Process of Adult Development

(3)The co-researchers have a high level of commitment to work, and seek meaningful careers of value to themselves and the community. Successful career renewal incorporated a mid-life review of values and goals. These goals included a wish to "give back" to others, realized through conducting transition workshops, mentoring/supporting others in similar situations, and/or by hiring other downsized individuals once the co-researcher had obtained new positions.

Level of Support Received from Others

(4) The co-researchers sought and received support from others. Support from family, but particularly from professional networks and colleagues, was a key theme in these experiences. These networks and colleagues served as sources of validation and insulation against the tendency to feel like a "failure" because of rejection by the downsizing agency.

Impact of Situational Factors such as the Manner in Which the Downsizing was Handled by the Employer and Other Concurrent Stresses

(5) The importance of being treated with respect by the downsizing organization and by professional colleagues is recognized. Open and honest communication and the provision of career transition services in recognition of the special issues being faced by the downsized employee were significant. In cases where these elements were present, the trauma to individuals was mitigated. Where these factors were not present, the negative effects persisted.

(6) Factors related to personal/lifeplan issues and the co-researcher's approach to these factors had an effect on the experience. Factors with a negative effect included health issues for the co-researcher herself, as well as death of close family members during the transition period. More positive effects resulted in those cases in which the co-researcher had kept marketable skills up-to-date, or had prior experience with downsizing situations.

The Contribution of Factors such as a Sense of Control Over the Process and Development of Effective Strategies

(7) The initiative employed by the co-researchers in developing strategies and coping mechanisms played a significant role in their career renewal. The level of adaptability and resilience, accompanied by a sense of self-efficacy and internal locus of control, guided the co-researcher down a successful path to renewal and reinvigoration in mid-life.

These themes do not exist discretely. Many themes overlap, and it is often difficult to place a certain piece of the experience in one theme or another. These individuals all describe the downsizing in serious terms, as an event with a lasting impact on their personal and professional lives.

Conclusions and Recommendations

For many of the co-researchers, this experience included periods of self-doubt, and the reappraisal of previous vocational choices as described by Aslanian & Brickell (1980.) This reappraisal is exhibited in differing ways in the different narratives. These differing ways include reformulation of the role of work in the individual's life plan, the development of new career strategies, and re-commitment to the original choice similar to the findings of Bejian & Salomone, 1995; Eby & Buch, 1995; Murphy & Burck, 1976.

Never-the-less, common themes emerge which are applicable across the individual experiences related. Review of these common themes demonstrates that the manner and degree in which career renewal is experienced is affected by factors related to the inner self, to the personal and work environment, and to the transition process itself. These conclusions, and respective sub-conclusions, are presented below.

The Role of the Individual

(1) Mid-life career renewal, initiated as a result of an involuntary career transition, is part of the lifelong process of occupational choice. Many co-researchers had already begun a mid-life re-examination of career goals and the relative place of career in their larger life plan. The downsizings provided the opportunity to think about the meaning of work and the role of work in their lives.

(2) The initial commitment to public service through the vehicle of federal employment is re-focused and directed toward other avenues of expression. The successful career renewers have incorporated to treat downsized employees

respectfully into how they deal with their own employees, how they carry the message to others, and in their choices of service-oriented new careers.

(3) Adaptability, resilience and a sense of personal control over the outcome provides a sense of liberation and facilitates career renewal. Knowing themselves, their transferable skills and their ability to exert control over their own careers were all part of the peak experience of career renewal for those in this study.

The Personal and Work Environment

(1) In order to experience successful career renewal, the changing nature of the employment contract must be accepted and embraced. Their federal careers had become major components of the co-researchers' sense of self-worth and personal identity. Their experiences teach them that employee loyalty and organizational tenure are not so important to employers as they once were, and that the nature of careers and employment contracts have altered.

(2) Career/lifeplan issues outside of the organizational setting impact the process. Factors present in current life situations, such as their own health and that of their parents, concern about financial issues and individual qualifications and prior experience all play a role in the relative smoothness of the career renewal

The Process Itself

(1) Being treated with respect by the downsizing organization has a positive effect on the career renewal experience. Properly implemented organizational support and open and honest communications with those being let go facilitated the retention of self-esteem and development of appropriate strategies.

(2) Support from family, colleagues and professional networks helps mitigate the "dark side" of the transition/renewal journey. As part of their career renewal experience, the co-researchers developed sources of support to overcome the obstacles in their path, and to integrate their career dreams and goals into the realities of the new work environment. Professional networks and colleagues served as sources of validation and insulation against the tendency to feel like a "failure" because of rejection by the employing agency.

Recommendations for Further Research

(1) Since this study focused on federal employees, further research is suggested to discover if involuntarily separated employees in other sectors of employment describe similar experiences.

(2) Because of the nature of the population from which the co-researchers were chosen (age and tenure considerations) the co-researchers were all in the mid-to-upper grade ranges (GS-9 to Senior Executive.) Further study could be done with employees at lower grade ranges and ages.

(3) While the male and female co-researchers shared similar experiences, therewere some gender differences noted. For example, females were more likely than males to report receiving substantive support from others during the transition period. Further study could be conducted to explore gender differences.

(4) Internal locus of control was an important factor in successful career renewal for the co-researchers in this study. Further research needs to be done to develop mechanisms to enhance the feeling of control over transition outcomes.

(5) The perception of open and honest communication with management and the provision of effective professional career transition services had a positive effect on the experiences related in this study. A research project could be conducted to contrast experiences of those who receive services with those who did not.

(6) None of the co-researchers had the benefit of support groups specifically centering around the experience of mid-life, mid-career job loss. Further study could ascertain the impact of such groups.

(7) With the exception of one Hispanic female, all co-researchers were Caucasian. Further study should review the possibility of differing experiences for those in various ethnic and racial groups.

Contributions to New Knowledge in HRD

This study has practical significance for human resource professionals, career counselors and individuals affected by downsizings in mid-career. The results provide human resource professionals with guidance to be used in implementing future downsizings. Career counselors can use the findings in helping outpaced employees (and others in mid-life) develop new definitions of careers and implement reconceptualized career plans. For individuals who will be affected by downsizing in the future, particularly - but not limited to - employees of the federal government, this study provides insights into the manner in which others in a similar situation have achieved a measure of career renewal. The implications of this study are

also relevant to individuals who are making voluntary career changes and/or experiencing career/life transitions.

Human Resource professionals are instrumental in developing training and information for employees which outline the realities of the new workplace. Their responsibilities should include developing materials and workshops which highlight the new ideas of career, the changing nature of employment, and the importance of keeping skills up to date and taking control of one's own career. Career Centers can be established to provide all employees, not just those experiencing job loss, with an opportunity to learn how to successfully manage a career change. Issues covered could be the examination of career related values, discovery of the relationship of other lifeplan issues to career, and exploration of the meaning of work for the individual being counseled. If an organization encourages continuous attention to career issues, employees may begin considering a transition long before external pressures forces them to do so. These kinds of transitions allow for downsizing by attrition and help assure the staffing of the organization by employees with the competencies required at that time.

The manner in which the organization handles the downsizing plays an important role in the career renewal process. If separated employees are treated with respect, provided with support services and, above all, not "shunned" by management and co-workers; they will have a more successful experience. This will result in fewer incidents of workplace violence and destruction of property by those departing. HR professionals can take the lead in establishing lines of communication, such as e-mail, printed material, telephone conferences, etc. It is incumbent upon management to ensure that these communications accurately reflect the position of the organization, where any cutbacks will be effected, and what other restructuring options are being considered.

In planning and implementing future downsizings, human resource managers can stress the importance of an analysis of workload distribution and other similar techniques prior to any decision on the types and numbers of positions to be eliminated. While the total numbers of employees will always be an issue, the focus needs to be on keeping organizations as lean and as efficient as possible, not on reducing numbers just to be able to say that a layer of management or a particular function has been eliminated.

While the experience of the RIF may not ever be a totally positive one, measures such as these will mitigate the negative feelings and encourage employees to expend their energies positively, re-looking their career objectives and taking appropriate steps to achieve them, rather than allowing the negativity to fester.

References

Abrego, P., & Brammer, L. (1992). Counseling adults in midlife transitions. In H. D. Lea, & Z. B. Leibowitz (Eds.) Adult career development (pp.234-253). Virginia: The National Career Development Association.

Atwood, J., Coke, E., Cooper, C., & Loria, K. (1995). Has Downsizing Gone Too Far? Jacksonville, FLA: University of North Florida.

Balutis, A. P. (1996 - February). Getting thin the healthy way. Government Executive 45-48.

Bejian, D.V., & Salomone, P. R. (1995). Understanding midlife career renewal: Implications for counseling. The Career Development Quarterly, 44, 52-61.

Boyatzis, R. E. (1998). Transforming Qualitative Information Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Bridges, W. (1994). Job shift: How to prosper in a workplace without jobs Reading, MA.: Addison-Wesley.

Cameron, K. S. (1994). Strategies for successful downsizing Human Resource Management 33, 2), 189-211.

Douglas, B. G., & Moustakas, C. (1984). Heuristic inquiry: The internal search to know Detroit, MI: Center for Humanistic Studies.

Drucker, P. F. (1995). Rethinking work. Executive Excellence 12, (2),5.

Eby, L. T., & Buch, K. (1995). Job loss as career growth: Responses to involuntary career transitions. Career Development Quarterly, 4, 26-42.

Erikson, E. H. (1963). Society and child New York: Norton.

Greller, M.M., & Stroh, L. K. (1995). Careers in mid-life: A fallow field in need of sustenanc Journal of Vocational Behavior, 47, 232-247.

Gutteridge, T.G., Leibowitz, Z.B., & Shore, J. E. (1993). Organizational career development Washington, DC: ASTD Press.

Hall, D. T., & Mirvis, P. H. (1995). The new career contract: Developing the whole person at midlife and beyond. Journal of Vocational Behavior 47, 269-289.

Kvale, S. (1996). Interviews: An introduction to qualitative research interviewing Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Lacey, D. (1988). The Paycheck Disruption New York: Hippocrene Books.

Latack, J. C. (1990). Organizational restructuring and career management: From outplacement and survivalto inplacement. In G. R. Ferris & K. M. Rowland (Eds.)Research in personnel and human resource managementGreenwich, CT: JAI Press.

Latack, J. C., & Dozier, J. B. (1986). After the ax falls: Job loss as a career transition.Academy of Management Review, 11, 375-392.

Levinson, D. J., Darrow, D. , Klein, E., Levinson, M., & McKee, B. (1978)The Seasons of a Man's Life New York: Knopf.

Levinson, D. J. (1986). A conception of adult developmentAmerican Psychologist 3, 3-13.

Moustakas, C. (1990). Heuristic research: Design, methodology, and applicationsNewbury Park: Sage Publications.

Murphy, P.P., & Burck, H. D. (1976). Career development of men at mid-lifeJournal of Vocational Behavior 337-343.

National Performance Review (1993).From red tape to results: Creating a government that works better and costs less report of the National Performance Review Washington, DC: Government Printing Office.

National Performance Review (1997). Serving the American public: Best practices in downsizing Washington, DC: Government Printing Office.

Reason, P. (1994). Three approaches to participative inquiry. In N. K. Denzin, & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.)Handbook of Qualitative Research Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Rifkin, J. (1995). The end of work: The decline of the global labor force and the dawn of the post-market eraNew York: G. P. Putnam's Sons.

Rubin, H. J., & Rubin, I. S. (1995). Qualitative interviewing: The art of hearing data Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Sargent, A. G., & Schlossberg, N. K. (1988). Managing adult transitions.Training and Development Journal 42 (12), 55-60.

Schlossberg, N. K., Waters, E. B., & Goodman, J. (1995). Counseling adults in transition; Second EditionNew York: Springer Publishing Company.

Seidman, I. (1998). Interviewing as Qualitative Research New York: Teachers College Press.

Super, D. E. (1957). The psychology of careers New York: Harper & Row.

Super, D. E. (1980). A life-span, life-space approach to career development.Journal of Vocational Behavior 16, 282-298.

Super, D. E. (1990). A life-span, life-space approach to career development. In D. Brown, & L. Brooks (Eds.)Career choice and development: Applying contemporary theories to practice San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Super, D. E., Savikas, M. L., & Super, C.M. (1996). The Life-span, life-space approach to careers. In D. Brown, L. Brooks, & Assocs. (Eds.), Career Development and Choice (1996) San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Whitehead, K. D. (Ed.). (1996). Federal Personnel Guide Washington, D. C.: Key Communications Group, Inc.

The Role of Acculturation in Career Advancement among Hispanic Corporate Managers

Lizette Zuniga
Cindy Skaruppa
Toni Powell
Barry University

This qualitative study investigated the role of acculturation in career advancement and the ways in which Hispanic corporate managers have advanced their careers, and then compared Mendoza's (1989) theory of acculturation to the propositions derived from the data collected from this study. The findings revealed that Hispanic corporate managers viewed acculturation and career advancement as directly related to each other. Mendoza's theory of acculturation was substantiated by the findings.

Keywords: Diversity, Acculturation, Cross-Cultural HRD

Problem Statement

This study proposes that a link exists between adaptation to the host culture and career advancement in the corporate arena among Hispanic corporate managers. The phenomenal surge of the Hispanic population in the United States has escalated the interest in acculturation in the workplace and the representation of Hispanics at all levels of the organization. The U.S. Labor Department forecasts that by the year 2015, Hispanics will have become the largest ethnic minority group in the United States. Exter (1987) estimated that the Hispanic minority would eventually become larger than all other minorities combined. Crispell (1990) recognized that the number of Hispanic workers could increase at a rate more than four times the rate of white, non-Hispanic workers by 2000. As the number of Hispanics in the United States has continued to increase, legal statutes such as Title VII of the Civil Rights Acts of 1964 and the Executive Order 11246, have been rigorously enforced in order to ensure equal opportunity employment practices in the workplace. However, it is surprising to note that in a 1994 tally of U.S. government positions, only 80 or approximately one percent of Hispanics had been appointed to Senior Executive Service positions (Mendosa, 1994).

Because of the increasing Hispanics in the workforce and the legal issues of employment practices, several significant problems have emerged. These include: 1) few effective diversity and acculturation management training programs for Hispanics; 2) non-acculturated Hispanics who have higher job termination rates; 3) conflicting work values which exist between Hispanics and non-Hispanics; and 4) job discrimination issues which Hispanics face.

Human resource professionals and corporate management have found it difficult to assist Hispanic corporate professionals to compete effectively in the Anglo workplace due to a dearth of research-based strategies. The proliferation of management and diversity training programs has not been strongly supported by theoretical and research development (Cox, 1993). Additionally, these educational packages have been geared toward an Anglo audience in order for Anglos to learn to work with individuals from diversified backgrounds. While these training programs have focused on diversity, no efforts have been made regarding acculturation training (Cox, 1991). Although an extensive body of research exists on acculturation, there is little which relates acculturation to the domain of work-related issues. However, from the small number of studies that have been published, it appears that there is a positive relationship between the domains of work and acculturation (Edwards, Rosenfeld, & Thomas, 1990; Chavez & Buriel, 1986; Domino & Acosta, 1987).

Edwards, Rosenfeld, and Thomas (1990) conducted a comparison study of Hispanic and Anglo blue-collar, Navy civilian employees. The findings of the study showed that acculturation is a central variable when related to job termination, with less acculturated Hispanics experiencing higher job termination after one year (Edwards, Rosenfeld, & Thomas, 1990).

Chavez and Buriel (1986) suggested that there is a difference between the value systems developed in immigrant homes outside of the United States and those developed in homes in the United States. Individuals raised outside the United States had parents who valued the outcomes of hard work rather than the work itself, whereas the United-States-born-and- raised individuals prioritized the process of working hard and de-emphasized the outcomes.

Copyright retained by the authors

Sanchez and Brock (1996) investigated the problem of perceived discrimination as a major stressor in the workplace. They studied 139 employed Hispanics in Miami-Dade County (Miami, Florida), with 60 percent of the participants identifying themselves as Cuban-American, the largest ethnic subgroup in Miami-Dade County. The findings demonstrated that the Cuban-Americans who grew up in the United States experienced high paying jobs, pleasant work environments, and faced the least amount of perceived discrimination.

Theoretical Framework

Historically, acculturation has been defined as a linear process in which an individual progresses along a single continuum, moving from being totally Hispanic to non-Hispanic (Gordon, 1964). This approach implies that as one is immersed into the host culture, the characteristics of the culture-of-origin diminish. Acculturation researchers tested this linear model and found that this rather simplistic framework did not sufficiently portray the multifaceted dimensions of acculturation (Szapocznik, Scopetta, Kurtines, & Aranalde, 1978; Garcia & Lega, 1979; Berry, 1986).

Mendoza (1989) developed a multidimensional acculturation model which recognized affective, cognitive, and behavioral adaptation processes, including interfamilial, extra familial language usage, social affiliation, cultural familiarity, and cultural identification. Mendoza (1989) postulated that because acculturation involves the blend of at least two cultures, theoretical and empirical frameworks must measure and delineate the degree of procurement of the customs of the host country, as well as the extent of retention of native cultural norms. Additionally, Mendoza (1989) described four typological patterns of acculturation: 1) cultural resistance, either on an active or passive level, against the acquisition of alternative cultural norms, while preserving native customs; 2) cultural shift, a replacement of provisional societal standards for native customs; 3) cultural incorporation, an acculturation of customs from both native and alternate cultures; and 4) cultural transmutation, a modification of native and alternate cultural practices to establish a unique subculture entity. Because of the extensive literature on acculturation and the limited research on how acculturation relates to work-related issues, this study integrated several noteworthy suggestions made by researchers which included: 1) Sanders and Nee (1987) suggested distinguishing between various job positions as they relate to acculturation; 2) Celano and Tyler (1991) suggested considering education level, time exposed to the host culture, age exposed to the host culture, and socioeconomic status as significant variables when analyzing acculturation; and 3) Cox (cited in Sanchez & Brock, 1996) suggested a need for research-based training to be delivered in the workplace.

Research Questions

The purpose of this study was to explore, using Mendoza's multidimensional theory and definition of acculturation, the ways in which Hispanic managers have made career advancements over their years in corporate America. This study utilized a grounded theory approach to compare Mendoza's theory of acculturation to the propositions extracted from the data of this study. The major research question of this study asked what role acculturation played in career advancement among Hispanic corporate managers. The following operationalized the major research question: 1) How do Hispanic corporate managers advance their careers? 2) How do these Hispanic corporate managers view the role of acculturation in career advancement? 3) What is the difference between someone who has acculturated and someone who has not in the workplace? 4) To what extent are Hispanic corporate managers acculturated? 5) What are the work values espoused by Hispanic corporate managers? 6) What aspects of training would be crucial for a human resource professional to emphasize in assisting Hispanic corporate professionals to attain their career goals?

Research Design and Methodology

The research design selected for this study was a dominant-less-dominant mixed methodology with the qualitative paradigm as the primary methodology and the quantitative section as an auxiliary component in the overall research design (Creswell, 1994). One of the advantages of qualitative inquiry is that it offers the researcher an opportunity to engage in an in-depth exploration of a topic. Additionally, qualitative research strives to understand the meaning of action to the informant and can offer human resource professionals a tremendous data base in which to emphasize particular methods which appear to work. The inductive nature of the qualitative paradigm provided the structure of the research, yet permitted for quantitative inquiry for triangulation purposes (Creswell, 1994).

The participants consisted of five Hispanic corporate managers who worked at a Fortune 500 organization. The researchers chose the purposeful sampling procedures, which is a strategy in which particular settings, persons, or events are selected deliberately in order to provide important information that may not be secured from other choices (Maxwell, 1996). Because a small sample was utilized, the cases were deliberately selected in order to achieve representation of Hispanic corporate managers. Careful selection to achieve ample diversity included gender, age, age of participants when first introduced to the U.S. culture, number of years of residence in the United States, position in the company, marital status, educational level, length of time employed by current employer, annual income, and number of job promotions held since the participant began working in corporate America.

Data Collection

Semi-structured interviews were conducted. Prior to this study, the researchers performed a pilot study to determine the effectiveness of the interview protocol, which was guided by questions such as: What personal characteristics do you possess that have enhanced your career? What has been the single most influential factor in your career advancement? What are some of your beliefs about how work should be done? What are your thoughts about teamwork? What strategies have you used to advance your career? As a result of the pilot study, the same questions were used on the actual interview protocols. Each participant was interviewed formally one time. The interviews lasted approximately one hour and were audiotaped and later transcribed. Four of the five interviews took place in a setting distant from the workplace. One participant specifically requested that the interview take place at the work site. After the tapes were transcribed, informal discussions took place with the participants concerning the interpretation of the interviews. In conjunction with the data collected by the interviews, the study utilized field notes, the information gathered from the Cultural Life Style Inventory (Mendoza, 1989), and a demographic questionnaire.

Since Mendoza's (1989) theory of acculturation was utilized as a backdrop to explore acculturation and career advancement, Mendoza's revised Cultural Life Style Inventory, 2.0 (1989) was chosen to collect quantifiable data to further understand the phenomenon of acculturation. This 29-item instrument measures the extent to which an individual's cultural life style is reflected on three subscales: cultural resistance (CR), cultural incorporation (CI), and cultural shift (CS) tendencies. Dominant and non-dominant cultural lifestyle tendencies can be determined by comparing the differences among CR, CI, and CS scores for statistical significance. A cultural lifestyle matrix can be obtained by identifying the most frequent lifestyle tendency (CR, CI, or CS) (Mendoza, 1989). The three cultural lifestyle subscales are derived by measuring five factors. These are: 1) intra familial language, 2) extra familial language, 3) social affiliation, 4) cultural familiarity and activities, and 5) cultural identification and pride. Acceptable levels of reliability were obtained. Cronbach's alpha reported across all factors were: .87 for intra familial language, .91 for extra familial language, .89 for social affiliation, .84 for cultural familiarity and activities and .89 for cultural identification and pride. Test-retest reliability range from .88 to .95, demonstrating significant correlations. Construct and content validity were also shown. The result of these analyses demonstrated a strong support for each: eta=.420, $p<.001$ for cultural shift, eta= .458, $p < .001$ for cultural resistance, and eta = .390, $p < .001$ for cultural incorporation (Mendoza, 1989). Mendoza postulated cultural transmutation as an aspect of his theory; however, it is not an indicator on his instrument. Cultural transmutation was identified from the researchers' field notes and observations made during the interviews.

Data Analysis

During the data analysis process, the transcribed interviews were coded and categorized, followed by member checks and theme identification. Coding, which assists the qualitative researcher in sorting the data and uncovering underlying meanings in the text (Maxwell, 1996), was inductively produced and materialized from the participants'descriptions of their career and acculturation experiences. The researchers followed the eight steps of coding suggested by Creswell (1994). First, we gathered a sense of the whole by reading through each transcript carefully. Next, we selected one document and read through the transcript, asking ourselves the underlying meaning of the interview. Third, we made a list of all the topics, clustered together similar topics, and then formed these topics into columns categorized by the major topics. We then went back through the data with the categorized columns and analyzed the extent to which the organized scheme fit and whether new categories emerged. After drawing lines between the categories to demonstrate interrelationships, we made a final decision on the categories and the paradoxes which were emerging. Each theme was then reviewed in conjunction with the research questions.

Credibility, or the extent to which the data which were collected can be supported or challenged, was established through several means. Trustworthiness was achieved through triangulation. We compared the

participants'perspectives with the researchers'analyses and conclusions, and the Cultural Life Style Inventory responses. By using a dominant less-dominant combined methodology, with the quantitative data being obtained from the Inventory, we were provided with an additional source of information. Additionally, the researchers engaged in an ongoing dialogue about our interpretations of the participants'reality and meanings, which served to ensure the truth value of the data.

There are limitations to the study. First, all participants involved in this study were of Hispanic origin and more specifically, of Cuban origin, which limits the representativeness of the findings. The acculturation and career advancement experiences shared from these Hispanic managers may not be the same for managers from different ethnic backgrounds. Second, the data for this study was based on the responses of managers represented from the finance industry. The findings may or may not have been the same if the study had included non-manager participants representing a number of different industries.

Findings

The following findings were identified as a result of the data analysis: 1) Hispanic corporate managers advanced their careers by demonstrating flexibility, integrity, hard work, and good leadership skills; 2) Hispanic corporate managers viewed the role of acculturation and career advancement as directly related to each other; 3) The main difference, as noted by the Hispanic corporate managers, between acculturated and non-acculturated individuals was that the acculturated individual was deemed a more preferred employee than the non-acculturated individual. The acculturated individual was observed to be flexible, comfortable with diversity, changing with the environment, and persistent in his/her business dealings, whereas the non-acculturated individual was regarded as rigid, uncomfortable with change, easily frustrated, and consistently engaged in black-and-white-thinking; 4) Three of the five Hispanic corporate managers were more culturally shifted towards an American lifestyle. These three were more open to adaptation towards the host culture; however, one participant was profiled as culturally resistant (rejecting the host culture customs) and another as culturally incorporated (adapting towards host culture norms while preserving Cuban customs); 5) The work values espoused by these Hispanic managers included family, integrity, good leadership skills, good communication skills, and effective teamwork skills; and 6) The human resource professional, in developing a training program for Hispanic corporate professionals, needs to emphasize principles of teamwork, leadership skills, communication skills, diversity training, and ethical standards for the workplace.

Recommendations and Research Contribution for HRD Practice

While this research was originally intended to result in the development of a new theory that combined the domain of acculturation with the domain of career advancement, the researchers used the data to generate four propositions regarding the interaction of acculturation with career advancement. The intent of these propositions is to serve as a resource for researchers and practitioners to view career advancement among minority corporate professionals from a unique perspective.

While the data collected were compared to the theory of acculturation postulated by Mendoza, the findings also contribute to an expanded understanding of acculturation theory and career advancement. Mendoza's theory of acculturation emphasizes the process of cultural adaptation; however, his concept does not deal with career advancement or work related issues. The findings of this research study provide the basis for a new set of premises. In particular, these propositions allow for an understanding of the relationship between acculturation and career advancement. The propositions offer an explanation of the relationship between acculturation and career advancement, and are as follows: 1) Cultural resistance to the host culture appears to impact the immigrant's level of career advancement. 2) Immigrants who embrace the host culture and either shift towards the host culture or incorporate the two cultures will more likely achieve his/her work-related goals than the immigrant who resists cultural adaptation. 3) The acculturated immigrant who applies the qualities necessary to acculturate to the workplace will be more likely to advance his/her career. 4) The immigrant who considers the positive benefits of both cultural influences will more likely achieve his/her career goals.

Implications

Based on the analysis of this study, the researchers have presented how acculturation and career advancement are

interrelated. The acculturated immigrant who applies the qualities necessary to acculturate to the workplace will be more likely to advance his/her career. In other words, the immigrant who has learned to adapt, be flexible, be open-minded, to cooperate with others and deal with diversity in the process of acculturation is more likely to advance his/her career. The findings of this study are linked to each of the primary functions of the HRD professional, which include training and development, organizational development, management and career development to improve individual, group and organizational effectiveness.

The HRD professional has the challenge of developing and implementing a strong diversity initiative program so that Hispanic corporate professionals continue to receive development opportunities that prepare them for advancement into higher level positions. In addressing organizational needs, the HRD professional needs to focus on gender and racial and ethnic prejudices which continue to persist in the workforce. The study also provides information for the HRD professional to create unique acculturation training programs for Hispanic corporate professionals. Acculturation strategy development for Hispanic corporate professionals should include knowledge and skills training sessions on teamwork principles, communication skills, leadership skills, ethical standards and practices, and dealing with diversity in the workplace.

The outcomes of this study substantiate the research findings that suggest a need for research-based training to be delivered in the workplace, (cited in Sanchez & Brock, 1996). Acculturation evaluations coupled with acculturation training sessions need to be considered during new employee orientation sessions. Subsequently, the HRD professional can guide the Hispanic corporate professional in developing a unique career plan and assist the individual into training programs which will help accomplish his or her career goals.

Recommendations for Future Research

1) Subsequent studies should examine causality factors for career advancement for Hispanics.
2) Quantitative studies are needed to measure positive and negative aspects of the career advancement of Hispanics in the corporate arena.
3) Research on diversity and acculturation training programs needs to be conducted to isolate the career advancement strategies which are most effective for Hispanics.
4) Diversity and acculturation training programs should be evaluated to determine the effectiveness in career advancement of Hispanic managers.
5) Both qualitative and quantitative studies on acculturation should be performed on non-Hispanic minority groups.

References

Berry, J.W. (1986). The acculturation process and refugee behavior. In C.L. Williams & J. Westermeyer (Eds.), Refugee mental health in resettlement countries. New York: Hemisphere.

Celano, M. & Tyler, F. (1991). Behavioral acculturation among Vietnamese refugees in the United States. The Journal of Social Psychology, 13, (3), 373-385.

Chavez, J.M. & Buriel, R. (1986). Reinforcing children's effort: A comparison of immigrant, native-born Mexican-American and Euro-American mothers. Hispanic Journal of Behavioral Sciences, 8, 127-142.

Creswell, J. (1994). Research design: Qualitative and quantitative approaches. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Domino, G. & Acosta, A. (1987). The relation of acculturation and values in Mexican-Americans. Hispanic Journal of Behavioral Sciences, 9, 131-150.

Edwards, J., Rosenfeld, P. & Thomas, P. (1990). Hispanic and Anglo males in the Navy's blue-collar civilian work force: A comparison of new hirees. (NPRDC-TN-90-24) San Diego: Navy Personnel Research and Development Center.

Garcia, M. & Lega, L. (1979). Development of Cuban ethnic identity questionnaire. Hispanic Journal of Behavioral Sciences, 1, (3), 247-261.

Maxwell, J. (1996). Qualitative research design: An interactive approach. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Mendosa, R. (1994). The 1994 corporate elite. Hispanic Business, 16, 20-48.

Mendoza, R. (1989). An empirical scale to measure type and degree of acculturation in Mexican-American adolescents and adults. Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology, 20, 372-385.

Miles, M.B. & Huberman, A.M. (1994). Qualitative data analysis: An expanded sourcebook. (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Patton, M.Q. (1990). Qualitative evaluation and research methods. (2nd ed.). Newbury Park, CA: Sage.

Sanchez, J. & Brock, P. (1996). Outcomes of perceived discrimination among Hispanic employees: Is diversity management a luxury or a necessity? Academy of Management Journal, 39, (3), 704-719.

Sanders, J. & Nee, V. (1987). Limits of ethnic solidarity in the enclave economy. American Sociological Review, 52, 745-773.

Szapocznik, J., Scopetta, M., Kurtines, W., & Aranalde, M. (1978). Theory and measurement of acculturation. International Journal of Psychology, 12, 113-130.